**Minutes of Tripartite Terminal Project Review Meeting of Sustainable Rural Energy Development (SRED) Programme**

Venue: UNDP CO, Pyongyang, DPRK.

Date and time: 21 October 2014 from 10:00 – 12:00

Tripartite Terminal Project Review (TTPR) Meeting of SRED was presided over by Co-chairpersons, Ms. Shabnam Mallick, Deputy Resident Representative and Mr. Pak Kyong Chol, Coordinator of NCC for UNDP (See Annex 1). There were attended by programme and project officers, senior officers and experts from UNDP, Ministry of Electrical Power Industry and State Academy of Science (see List of Participants in the Annex 2).

The co-chairpersons welcomed the participants for coming to review the termination of project and discuss on lessons learnt, follow up actions and fund management.

Zharas Takenov, Project Manager (PM) of SRED informed that the SRED Final Project Review Report was prepared and shared in advance with participants. PM presentation is highlighted that the task of TTPR is to aassess the performance and success of the project, and its contribution to related outcomes. Topics during the review included:

* Achievements of last year targets;
* Overall project performance and sustainability of results;
* Achievement on capacity development;
* Outstanding activities;
* Lessons learned;
* Use of remaining budget, if any;
* Effective date of project closure;
* Transitioning of responsibilities to national counterparts;
* Hand-over of remaining assets.

While endorsing in general good overall project performance of SRED project (See Annex 3) the members of TTPR meeting reconfirmed achievement of outputs as following:

Programme Development Phase:

“Provinces and cooperative farms identified for pilot demonstration schemes in rural energy development” are completed in 2011.

Implementation Phase:

“Demonstration activities implemented and running successfully is completed” in 2014;

“Capacity development needs identified and training programmes implemented” is completed in 2012;

“Lessons learned and ‘good-practices’ compiled for sharing and knowledge management” is partially completed in 2014;

“New rural energy initiative designed” is completed in 2014.

Total Project Budget after resumption in 2010 was US$ 5,035,596. During 5 years from 2005-2010 the Project spent only 13.6% of the resources. In 2011 the delivery drastically increased to 14.8%, 27.3% in 2012, 20.9% in 2013. Cooperative Farms provided in-kind local labor and safety premises to storage of procured equipment and materials.

Breakdown of budget by years from 2006-2014:

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Approved Total****SRED Budget** | **Expenditure** **2005-2010** | **Expenditure** **2011** | **Expenditure** **2012** | **Expenditure** **2013** | **Remained funding 2014** | **Expected delivery 2014**  |
| (US$) | (US$) | (US$) | (US$) | (US$) | (US$) | (US$) |
| **5,650,000.00** | **768,294.15** | **836,825.95** | **1,544,772.83** | **1,183,251.03** | **1,316,856.04** | **1,001,050** |
| (100%) | (13.6%) | (14.8%) | (27.3%) | (20.9%) | (23.3%) | (17.7%) |

The total cost of equipment was determined at 30% of the total project budget in amount of USD 1,510,678.95. SRED utilized USD 1,216,990.42. Expected delivery by end of project on 31 October of 2014 is USD 1,001,050. So far SRED delivered USD 449,350 and until end of October 2014 committed budget is USD 552,700.

 The TTPR meeting participants in details discussed the following constraints and lessons learned:

* Project design is not relevant to the current country context;
* Lack of institutional memory and poor project files after resumption by 2011;
* Political tensions lead to stop, postpone and send back several international missions;
* Problems with local payment lead to implementation delays;
* Vendors do not respond to calls for bidding, equipment prices are extremely high;
* Low response from transportation companies and very high prices due to high risk, lack of information and experience;
* Lack of capacity of local institutions/experts to organize proper supervision, coordinate with end users and monitor of installation, conduct assessment;
* Absence of access to electricity during installation for welding, drilling, mixing and other tools’ work;
* Absence of direct communication with local experts and between local and international experts;
* Lack of access to information;
* Severe winter conditions prevent installation of some equipment from December - February;
* Unavailability of partners in CoFs for some periods during agricultural seasons added delays;
* Turnover of UNDP local staff.

Recommendations of the TTPR meeting:

* SRED performance from 2011-2014 was assed as satisfactory and the results of AWP 2014 were endorsed and assessed as achieving its results.
* All participants agreed on the SRED project operationally closure according to the UNDP rules and regulations by October 2014.
* Constraints and lessons learned were discussed by the PSC members and it should be taken into account for the next generation of projects for design and implementation in DPRK;
* SRED and SWEDPRA assets could not transferred to the Government by SRED project. Meantime the assets will be under custody of UNDP CO until further guidance on the assets transfer from UNDP HQ would be received. The assets monitoring will continue by UNDP M&E Specialist using SRED management budget as SRED will not be financially closed during one year after project operationally closer on 31 October 2014;
* Access to the SRED project sites will be guaranteed by Government partners;
* The following outstanding activities: (i)“Solar Photovoltaic and Solar Hot Water System” will be done from 24-31 October (according to PO if equipment is not be provided by 26 October UNDP will terminate contract with vendor); (ii)“Printing publications for awareness - building campaigns” will be done by 28 October, (iii)“Local Technical Supervision on Household Biogas System” and (iv) “Local Technical Supervision on Solar PV and Solar Hot Water System” will be completed on 31 October 2014. (v)Contract with IDS experts for “Local experts on rural energy surveys, energy assessment for rural area identification of additional provinces/counties and research on legal/institutional framework for new rural energy intervention development” will be terminated before end of October;
* Project document for New Project UNDP intervention in Rural Energy Development will be shared by UNDP with national partners;
* It is important to cost in-kind local and Government contribution in budgets of new projects.

ANNEXES:

**ANNEX 1:**

**Agenda of Terminal Tripartite Project Review Meeting of Sustainable Rural Energy Development (SRED) Programme**

21 October 2014, Tuesday 10:00 – 12:00

Venue - UNDP CO Conference Room

**Co-chairperson**: Ms. Shabnam Mallick, Deputy Resident Representative, UNDP DPRK

**Co-chairperson**: Mr. Pak Kyong Chol, Coordinator of National Coordinating Committee for UNDP

**10:00-10:10 – Opening Remarks**:

Ms. Shabnam Mallick, Deputy Resident Representative, UNDP DPRK

Mr. Pak Kyong Chol, Coordinator of National Coordinating Committee for UNDP

**10:10-10:40 – Presentation**:

**“SRED Final Project Review Report for the period since 2011 until October 2014”**

Mr. Zharas Takenov, SRED Project Manager

**10:40-11:30 Issues, Questions, Answers, Discussion and Statement** by Project Steering Committee Members.

**11:30-12:00 – Wrap-ups**:

Ms. Shabnam Mallick, Deputy Resident Representative, UNDP DPRK

Mr. Pak Kyong Chol, Coordinator of National Coordinating Committee for UNDP

**ANNEX 2.**

**List of the Joint Project Steering Committee Meeting on December 12, 2013 Thursday**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **No** |  **Name Position** |
|   | Ms. **Shabnam Mallick** | Deputy Resident Representative, UNDP DPRK |
| 2 | Mr. **Zharas Takenov** | SRED/SWEDPRA Project Manager, UNDP DPRK |
| 3 | Mr. **Choe Song Chol** | Programme Analyst, UNDP DPRK |
| 4 | Mr. **Yu Kwang** | Programme Assistant, UNDP DPRK |
| 5 | Mr. **Paek Kyong Chol** | Administrative Assistant, SRED, UNDP DPRK |
| 7 | Mr. **Pak Kyong Chol** | Coordinator of National Coordinating Committee for UNDP |
| 8 | Ms. **Hong Jong Hui** | Senior Officer of Bureau of External Affairs, MEPINational Project Director (NPD) of SRED, UNDP DPRK |
| 11 | Mr. **Kim Ryong Chol** | Officer of Korea Science Corporation of SAOS,Former Project Technical Manager of SWEDPRA, UNDP DPRK |
| 12 | Mr. **Hong Ryun Gi** | General Director, Bureau of International Cooperation on Science, SAOS |

**ANNEX 3.**

Power point presentations of PM of SRED:

****

****

****

****

****

****

****

****

****

****

****

****

****

****